BOARD OF EQUALIZATION MINUTES
GILA COUNTY, ARIZONA

Date: October 4, 2016

MICHAEL A. PASTOR
Chairman

TOMMIE C. MARTIN
Vice-Chairman

JOHN D. MARCANTI
Member

MARIAN E. SHEPPARD
Clerk of the Board

By: Marian E. Sheppard
Clerk of the Board

Gila County Courthouse
Globe, Arizona

PRESENT: Michael A. Pastor, Chairman; Tommie C. Martin, Vice-Chairman (via ITV); John D. Marcanti, Member; Marian E. Sheppard, Clerk of the Board; Laurie J. Kline, Deputy Clerk; Deborah Hughes, Assessor; C. Lynn Mata, Chief Appraiser

Item 1 – CALL TO ORDER – PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairman Pastor called this meeting to order at 1:30 p.m. Laurie Kline led the Pledge of Allegiance.

Item 2 – AGENDA ITEMS:

A. Information/Discussion/Action to consider a Petition for Review of Real Property Values for tax parcel number 202-03-001E that was submitted by Ann Garlinghouse on behalf of Timothy M. Garlinghouse for tax year 2017.

Chairman Pastor called on Ms. Garlinghouse to present her appeal. The written documentation provided to the Board of Equalization (BOE) by Ms. Garlinghouse lists the basis for presenting this appeal, as follows: extreme limited property use; solid granite and diabase (gorannet) covered; no water, improvements or additional upgrades; and, not comparable to surrounding properties (parcel numbers 202-03-001C, 202-03-001J, 202-03-001H, and 202-03-001G).

Ms. Garlinghouse advised that she owns this property with her son, Timothy M. Garlinghouse. She stated that the subject property is located on Highway 288 towards Young, Arizona; the land is vacant and it has a rugged and steep terrain totaling approximately 17.5 acres. Ms. Garlinghouse stated, "The majority of this is wonderful if you are a mountain goat because there is no flat area on this section of ground." The full cash value (FCV) shown on the Notice

of Value for the subject property was initially $83,213 for tax year 2017; however, after Ms. Garlinghouse appealed that value to the Assessor, it was thereafter reduced to $36,750. Ms. Garlinghouse stated that the value has not been reduced enough due to the limited uses for the subject property because it is comprised of a steep and rugged terrain. She proceeded to review the values for properties that surround the subject property. She noted that the FCV for parcel number 202-03-001H is $36,115, which has 100% of useable land, plus it contains an orchard, mobile home (which Ms. Garlinghouse acknowledged that the mobile home was not included in the valuation), a metal building valued at $60,000, a solar well, and a septic system. Supervisor Marcanti questioned if the subject property has water or power to which Ms. Garlinghouse replied that it does not have water or power.

At the conclusion of Ms. Garlinghouse's presentation, Chairman Pastor called on C. Lynn Mata, Chief Appraiser, to address the BOE. Ms. Mata referred to an aerial map of the subject area that was displayed on an overhead screen.

Ms. Mata affirmed that when Ms. Garlinghouse initially appealed the FCV of the subject property in the amount of $83,213, the Assessor's Office did an adjustment to $36,750 or $1,875 per acre. She referred to parcel number 202-03-001D, which is located directly north of the subject property on the same side of Highway 288 and stated that it is most comparable to the subject property. She advised that -001D is also valued at $1,875 per acre. She also referenced the properties that are directly across the highway from the subject property, which have been developed somewhat for habitation so that is the reason they are valued higher at $2,500 per acre. Later in the conversation, Ms. Mata added that when the FCV value was adjusted for the subject property, the FCV of the surrounding properties were also adjusted for equity for the upcoming 2018 Notice of Value.

At this time there was considerable discussion on each of the comparable properties that were provided by Ms. Garlinghouse and those provided by the Assessor's Office. During Ms. Mata's presentation, she stated that the subject property backs up to the Tonto National Forest and that the subject property has mature trees, vegetation and wildlife indigenous to the area. She stated that the subject property can be developed for habitation with the proper home design and engineering techniques used for so much of Gila County's beautiful and desirable forest developed areas. Ms. Garlinghouse disagreed that there are mature trees and vegetation at present on these properties due to a fire that occurred in June 2016, and named the Juniper Fire. She also added that it would be very costly to build any home or structure on this property due to the terrain. Ms. Mata commented that the Juniper Fire would not be discussed at this time; however, she anticipates further adjustments will be made to the values of the subject property and surrounding properties for tax year 2018 due to the damage caused by fire. Ms. Garlinghouse was in disagreement regarding a statement from Ms. Mata and also Assessor Deborah

Hughes on how properties are valued. Ms. Garlinghouse acknowledged that she was told that a mobile home on one of the comparable properties was not factored into the property value; however, she said that during a recent visit to the Assessor's Office, she was told that the metal building affixed to one of the comparable properties, septic system and well were included in the property valuation. Ms. Mata stated, "Those are improvements on top of the land" and Ms. Garlinghouse replied, "That is not what you told me before." In concluding her presentation, Ms. Mata stated that she supports the Assessor's opinion of value at $36,750 or $1,875 per acre for the subject property.

Vice-Chairman Martin commented that she believes that the subject property and surrounding properties were all valued equitably as the same methodology was used for each property, so she expressed her support of the Assessor's opinion of value. She did state that Ms. Garlinghouse may submit this appeal to the next level, which would be the Arizona Tax Court. Supervisor Marcanti stated that he, too, felt that the property was valued correctly.

Chairman Pastor asked for a motion from the Board at this time. Upon motion by Vice-Chairman Martin, seconded by Supervisor Marcanti, the Board unanimously upheld the Assessor's opinion of the full cash value of parcel number 202-03-0001E in the amount of $36,750 for tax year 2017.

B. Information/Discussion/Action to consider a Residential Petition for Review of Valuation for tax parcel number 207-24-040 that was submitted by Joseph L. and Marguerite Elledge for tax year 2017.

Chairman Pastor read aloud this agenda item and stated that it was his understanding that Mr. and Mrs. Elledge withdrew their request for this hearing before the BOE as they had reached an agreement regarding the value of the subject property with the Assessor's Office to which Ms. Mata confirmed that statement was correct. The BOE did not take any action on this agenda item.

Item 3 – CALL TO THE PUBLIC: Call to the Public is held for public benefit to allow individuals to address the Board of Equalization on any issue within the jurisdiction of the Board of Equalization. Board members may not discuss items that are not specifically identified on the agenda. Therefore, pursuant to Arizona Revised Statute §38-431.01(H), at the conclusion of an open call to the public, individual members of the Board of Equalization may respond to criticism made by those who have addressed the Board, may ask staff to review a matter or may ask that a matter be put on a future agenda for further discussion and decision at a future date.

There were no comments from the public.

There being no further business to come before the Board of Equalization, Chairman Pastor adjourned the hearing at 2:27 p.m.

APPROVED:

Michael A. Pastor, Chairman

ATTEST:

Marian Sheppard, Clerk of the Board